Investigation of Commercial Vehicle Parking Permits in Toronto

Adam Rosenfield
James Lamers
Mehdi Nourinejad
Professor Matthew J. Roorda

February 26, 2016
Zero-tolerance rush hour policy introduced to downtown drivers

Vehicles towed from parking lanes part of the ‘new reality’ for Toronto drivers

CBC News  Posted: Jan 04, 2015 6:00 AM ET  |  Last Updated: Jan 05, 2015 10:18 PM ET

Toronto begins parking crackdown, tows 28 vehicles during ‘zero tolerance’ blitz

Josh Visser  January 5, 2015 10:56 AM ET
More from Josh Visser  @johvisser
ZERO-TOLERANCE ENFORCEMENT

Toronto Parking Enforcement officers ticket Wheel-Trans vehicles

By Dave Trafford

Vehicles displaying accessible parking permits are exempt from parking restrictions outside of the morning and afternoon rush hours. But parking regulations allow for taxis, limos and buses to stop for pick-ups and drop-offs no matter where or when.

Global News
90% of all parking tickets issued to courier vehicles in Canada are issued in downtown Toronto.
DENSITY OF COMMERCIAL VEHICLE TICKETING

Source: City of Toronto, 2012
ANALYSIS OF ILLEGAL PARKING IN TORONTO

➤ Parking tickets contribute over $100 million in city revenue

➤ Average fine paid per ticket by commercial vehicles is $44

➤ Distinction between fines issued and fines paid
  ➤ Courier companies aggressively fight tickets
  ➤ Batches of tickets are reduced or cancelled en masse
  ➤ High enforcement costs with diminished ticket revenue

➤ Between 1990 and 2013, only 81% of issued fines were ultimately collected

➤ $1.5 million in fines to commercial vehicles were cancelled in court in 2009
REASONS FOR TICKET CANCELLATION

- At trial: 26%
- By staff (approved): 22%
- Out-of-province: 25%
- Drove away: 16%
- Plate error: 10%
- Ticket error: 1%
### ADDRESSING PARKING NEEDS OF COMMERCIAL VEHICLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenges</th>
<th>Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>➤ Deliveries often occur in dense, congested downtowns</td>
<td>➤ Existing approaches:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>➤ Road real estate is valuable</td>
<td>➤ Alleyways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>➤ Off-street parking is scarce and expensive</td>
<td>➤ Loading docks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>➤ Freight delivery needs are not salient to the public</td>
<td>➤ Curbside parking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>➤ New policy approaches:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>➤ Exclusive delivery zones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>➤ Parking permits</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TORONTO’S APPROACH

1. Introduction of courier delivery zones (CDZs) across downtown

2. Exploration of parking permit program to exempt commercial vehicles from certain parking offense
RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

➤ Evaluate feasibility of courier delivery zones (CDZs) and parking permit policies to meet demands of commercial vehicles for on-street parking

➤ Assess municipal fiscal impacts of parking permits under various pricing schemes

➤ Develop strategies to facilitate legal curbside activity for commercial vehicles in Toronto with minimal impact to other road users
COURIER DELIVERY ZONES
# PERMIT PROGRAMS AROUND THE WORLD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Municipality</th>
<th>Annual Cost</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>$ 30</td>
<td>A maximum of 30 minutes in a loading zone or passenger zone, and any metered stay except during rush hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington, DC</td>
<td>$ 323</td>
<td>A maximum of two hour parking at a commercial vehicle loading zone during designated hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Houston</td>
<td>from $161 to $1,285</td>
<td>A maximum of 30 minutes to two hours parking in a loading zone or metered stall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minneapolis</td>
<td>$ 400</td>
<td>A maximum of 30 minutes in a loading zone, no parking zone, or before noon in a metered space</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
COMMERCIAL VEHICLE PARKING PERMITS

Policy Levers

- Price of Permit
- Vehicle Eligibility
- Exempted Offenses

Outcomes

- Program Adoption
- Compliance
- Social Costs
MODELING PARKING BEHAVIOR

Decision to Park

- Permit
- No Permit
  - Legal Parking
  - Illegal Parking
MODELING PARKING BEHAVIOR

Decision to Park

- Permit
  - Permit Cost
- No Permit
  - Legal Parking
  - Delays & Cost
  - Illegal Parking
  - Risk of Fine
PERMIT REVENUE

The graph illustrates the relationship between net revenue (in dollars) and adoption rate (%) for different permit fees. The x-axis represents the adoption rate in percentages, ranging from 0% to 100%. The y-axis shows net revenue, with values ranging from $1.5 million to $6.5 million. Several lines demonstrate the revenue for various permit fees, with $100, $200, $300, $400, $500, $600, $700, and $800 in blue, green, red, cyan, magenta, yellow, orange, and blue lines, respectively.
REVENUE SENSITIVITY TO PERMIT COST

![Graph showing revenue sensitivity to permit cost. The graph plots revenue (in dollars) against annual permit cost (in dollars). There are three curves: Permit Revenue, Ticket Revenue, and Total Revenue. The graph indicates how revenue changes with varying permit costs.]
KEY FINDINGS

➤ Permit can likely be revenue-neutral below $500, with potential savings from reduced enforcement & legal costs

➤ Permit can be made voluntary, but combined with purchase incentives

➤ High adoption rate is important for program success

➤ Surface parking downtown is important: Courier Delivery Zone (CDZ) pilot project should expand
KEY FINDINGS

➤ City must decide eligibility rules to balance priorities (e.g. couriers, private deliveries, shredding trucks, etc.)

➤ Perception of fairness is important for program success

➤ Permit can legitimize what is currently common illegal behaviour

➤ Further consultation with stakeholders is crucial
THANK YOU

James Lamers

james.lamers@mail.utoronto.ca